This paper investigates the role that the Neoplatonic motif of individuals' souls as manifestations of the divine Universal Soul that were exiled in human bodies played in Jewish conceptualizations of exile during the Islamic Middle Ages in Spain. It does so by analyzing two poems from the period, Solomon ibn Gabirol's “Mah Lakh Yehidah” (“What's Troubling You, My Soul?”) and Moses ibn Ezra’s “Nafshi Ivitikha Balaylah” (“My Soul Longs for You in the Night”), along with supplementary works by both authors. In each poem, the author appears to radically reconfigure the Jewish exile story in terms of the Neoplatonic exile motif, transforming a national experience of exile into an individualistic yearning for union with God and allegorizing the land of Israel’s redemptive status. Yet a closer reading of ibn Ezra’s poem indicates that he actually revises ibn Gabirol's individualistic Neoplatonism by superimposing the Jewish view of exile onto it, portraying a physical return to Israel in the messianic age as the way to achieve the Neoplatonists’ desired union of the soul with the divine on earth. The two poems illustrate the creative ways in which Jewish thinkers related their own tradition to the secular intellectual traditions around them, engendering new understandings of the relationship between Jews, God, and Israel in the process.