In May 1960, Israeli forces abducted Adolf Eichmann—a Nazi official who led the Department for Jewish Affairs of the Reich Main Security Office—and brought him to Jerusalem to stand trial for his crimes during World War II. In the months following Eichmann’s capture, American Jewish organizations sought to emphasize Eichmann’s crimes against humanity—as opposed to his crimes against the Jewish people—in order to assuage fears that the trial would be seen as unjust “Jewish vengeance,” a common accusation in the American Christian press. Although American Jewish leaders continued to maintain their own reservations about the Eichmann case, they feared that the trial’s vital moral questions regarding guilt and complicity would be overshadowed by persistent debates about the legal particularities of the case and Christian publications’ anti-Semitic comparisons of the “vengeful” trial to the crucifixion of Jesus Christ. The American Jewish organizations swiftly reversed their position in early 1961, defending Israel’s right to try Eichmann while newly confronting Christian and secular leadership about the Christian roots of anti-Semitism and Christian Europe’s complicity with the Third Reich. By analyzing the major American Jewish organizations’ responses to the anti-Semitic backlash in major Christian periodicals, this paper demonstrates the central role of the memory of the Holocaust in the transformation of American Jewish organizations’ conception of anti-Semitism from 1960 to 1962.